# Multivariate spatial nonparametric modelling via kernel processes mixing

Montserrat Fuentes and Brian Reich

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

# A.1

## Properly defined process prior

## Kolmogorov existence theorem

We need to prove that the collection of finite-dimensional distributions introduced in (1) define a stochastic process Y(s). We use the two Kolmogorov consistency conditions (symmetry under permutation, and dimensional consistency) to show that (1) defines a proper random process for Y.

**Proposition 1.** The collection of finite-dimensional distributions introduced in (1) properly define a stochastic process Y(s). We use the two Kolmogorov consistency conditions: symmetry under permutation, and dimensional consistency, to define properly a random process for Y.

Proof of Proposition 1:

Symmetry under permutation.

Let  $p_{i_j} = p(Y(s_j) = X(\phi_{i(s_j)}))$ , where  $\phi_{i(s_j)}$  is the centering knot of the kernel  $i(s_j)$  in the representation of  $F_{s_j}(Y)$  in (1), and let  $\phi_{i_j}$  be an abbreviation for  $\phi_{(i(s_j))}$ . Then,  $p_{i_1,\ldots,i_n}$ determine the site-specific joint selection probabilities. If  $\pi(1), \ldots, \pi(n)$  is any permutation of  $\{1, \ldots, n\}$ , then we have

$$p_{i_{\pi(1)},\dots,i_{\pi(n)}} = p(Y(s_{\pi(1)}) = X(\phi_{\pi(i_1)}),\dots,Y(s_{\pi(n)}) = X(\phi_{\pi(i_n)}))$$
$$= p(Y(s_1) = X(\phi_{i_1}),\dots,Y(s_n) = X(\phi_{i_n})) = p_{i_1,\dots,i_n},$$
(12)

since the observations are conditionally independent. Then,

$$p(Y(s_1) \in A_1, \dots, Y(s_n) \in A_n)$$

$$= \sum_{i_1, \dots, i_n} p(Y(s_1) = X(\phi_{i_1}), \dots, Y(s_n) = X(\phi_{i_n})) \delta_{X(\phi(i_1))}(A_1) \dots \delta_{X(\phi(i_n))}(A_n)$$

$$= \sum_{i_1, \dots, i_n} p_{i_1, \dots, i_n} \delta_{X(\phi(i_1))}(A_1) \dots \delta_{X(\phi(i_n))}(A_n)$$

$$= \sum_{i_1, \dots, i_n} p_{i_{\pi(1)}, \dots, i_{\pi(n)}} \delta_{X(\phi(i_{\pi(1)}))}(A_{\pi(1)}) \dots \delta_{X(\phi(i_{\pi(n)}))}(A_{\pi(n)})$$

$$= p(Y(s_{\pi(1)}) \in A_{\pi(1)}, \dots, Y(s_{\pi(n)}) \in A_{\pi(n)}),$$

and, the symmetry under permutation condition holds.

Dimensional consistency.

$$p(Y(s_{1}) \in (A_{1}), \dots, Y(s_{k}) \in \mathcal{R}, \dots, Y(s_{n}) \in (A_{n}))$$

$$= \sum_{(i_{1},\dots,i_{n})\in\{1,2,\dots\}^{n}} p_{i_{1},\dots,i_{n}} \delta_{X(\phi_{i_{1}})}(A_{1}) \cdots \delta_{X(\phi_{i_{k}})}(\mathcal{R}) \cdots \delta_{X(\phi_{i_{n}})}(A_{n})$$

$$= \sum_{(i_{1},\dots,i_{k-1},i_{k+1},\dots,i_{n})\in\{1,2,\dots\}^{n-1}} \delta_{X(\phi_{i_{1}})}(A_{1}) \cdots \delta_{X(\phi_{i_{k-1}})}(A_{k-1}) \delta_{X(\phi_{i_{k+1}})}(A_{k+1})$$

$$\cdots \delta_{X(\phi_{i_{n}})}(A_{n}) \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} p_{i_{1},\dots,i_{k-1},j,i_{k+1},\dots,i_{n}}$$

$$= p(Y(s_{1}) \in (A_{1}),\dots,Y(s_{k-1}) \in A_{k-1}, Y(s_{k+1}) \in A_{k+1},\dots,Y(s_{n}) \in (A_{n})). \quad (13)$$

In (13), we need

$$p_{i_1,\dots,i_{k-1},i_{k+1},\dots,i_n} = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} p_{i_1,\dots,i_{k-1},j,i_{k+1},\dots,i_n}$$

which holds by Fubini Theorem and the fact that X is a properly defined Gaussian process.

# A.2

# Proof of Theorem 1.

The covariance function C of the underlying process X has a first order derivative, C'. We introduce a Taylor expansion for C with a Lagrange remainder term,

$$C(|\phi_{i_1} - \phi_{i_2}|) = C(|s - s'|) + C'(\psi_{i_1, i_2})\varepsilon_{i_1, i_2},$$
(14)

where  $\varepsilon_{i_1,i_2} = (|\phi_{i_1} - \phi_{i_2}| - |s - s'|)$  and  $\psi_{i_1,i_2}$  is in between |s - s'| and  $|\phi_{i_1} - \phi_{i_2}|$ .

Assuming that s and s' lie on the support of the kernels  $K_{i_1}$  and  $K_{i_2}$ , respectively, i.e.  $|\phi_{i_1} - s| < \epsilon_{i_1}$  and  $|\phi_{i_2} - s'| < \epsilon_{i_2}$ . We have,

$$\varepsilon_{i_1,i_2} \le ||\phi_{i_1} - \phi_{i_2}| - |s - s'|| \le |(\phi_{i_1} - \phi_{i_2}) - (s - s')| \le \epsilon_{i_1} + \epsilon_{i_2} \le 2\epsilon,$$

and,

$$\varepsilon_{i_1,i_2} \ge -||\phi_{i_1} - \phi_{i_2}| - |s - s'|| \ge -|(\phi_{i_1} - \phi_{i_2}) - (s - s')| \ge -(\epsilon_{i_1} + \epsilon_{i_2}) \ge -2\epsilon,$$

Thus,  $-2\epsilon \leq \varepsilon_{i_1,i_2} \leq 2\epsilon$ .

Let p(s) be the potentially infinite vector with all the probabilities masses  $p_i(s)$  in  $F_s(Y)$ . The conditional covariance of the data process Y is written in terms of the covariance C of

X,

$$\operatorname{cov}(Y(s), Y(s')|p(s), p(s'), C) = \sum_{i_1 i_2} p_{i_1}(s) p_{i_2}(s') C(|\phi_{i_1} - \phi_{i_2}|),$$

since the kernels all have compact support, the expression above is the same as

$$\sum_{i_1,i_2;|\phi_{i_1}-s|<\epsilon_{i_1},|\phi_{i_2}-s'|<\epsilon_{i_2}} p_{i_1}(s)p_{i_2}(s')C(|\phi_{i_1}-\phi_{i_2}|).$$

Using the Taylor approximation in (14), the cov(Y(s), Y(s')|p(s), p(s'), C) can be written

$$C(|s-s'|)\left[\sum_{i_1} p_{i_1}(s)\right]\left[\sum_{i_2} p_{i_2}(s')\right] + \sum_{i_1,i_2; |\phi_{i_1}-s| < \epsilon_{i_1}, |\phi_{i_2}-s'| < \epsilon_{i_2}} p_{i_1}(s)p_{i_2}(s')C'(\psi_{i_1,i_2})\varepsilon_{i_1,i_2}.$$

Since C' is nonnegative and  $\varepsilon_{i_1,i_2} \in (-2\epsilon, 2\epsilon)$ , we have that for  $J_{i_1,i_2} = \{(i_1, i_2); |\phi_{i_1} - s| < \epsilon_{i_1}, |\phi_{i_2} - s'| < \epsilon_{i_2}\},$ 

$$-2\epsilon \sum_{i_{1},i_{2}\in J_{i_{1},i_{2}}} p_{i_{1}}(s)p_{i_{2}}(s')C'(\psi_{i_{1},i_{2}}) \leq \sum_{(i_{1},i_{2})\in J_{i_{1},i_{2}}} p_{i_{1}}(s)p_{i_{2}}(s')C'(\psi_{i_{1},i_{2}})\varepsilon_{i_{1},i_{2}}$$
$$\leq 2\epsilon \sum_{(i_{1},i_{2})\in J_{i_{1},i_{2}}} p_{i_{1}}(s)p_{i_{2}}(s')C'(\psi_{i_{1},i_{2}}), \quad (15)$$

where,

$$2\epsilon \sum_{i_1,i_2 \in J_{i_1,i_2}} p_{i_1}(s) p_{i_2}(s') C'(\psi_{i_1,i_2}) \longrightarrow_{\epsilon \to 0} 0,$$

because C' is bounded and the sum of probability masses is always bounded by 1. The sum of probability masses would be always bounded by 1, because by proposition 1 the prior process is properly defined.

Thus, we obtain

$$\operatorname{cov}(Y(s), Y(s')|p(s), p(s'), C) \longrightarrow_{\epsilon \to 0} C(|s - s'|) \left[\sum_{i_1} p_{i_1}(s)\right] \left[\sum_{i_2} p_{i_2}(s')\right] = C(|s - s'|).$$

Therefore, the conditional covariance of the data process Y approximates the covariance C of the underlying process X as the bandwiths of the kernel functions go to zero.

## A.3

#### Proof of Theorem 2.

The cross-covariance function  $C_{1,2}(s,s')$  of the underlying process  $X = (X_1, X_2)$  has first order partial derivatives  $\delta C_{1,2}(s,s')/\delta s$  and  $\delta C_{1,2}(s,s')/\delta s'$ . We introduce a Taylor expansion for  $C_{1,2}$  with a Lagrange remainder term,

$$C_{1,2}(\phi_{i_1},\phi_{i_2}) = C_{1,2}(s,s') + (\phi_{i_1}-s) \left[\delta C_{1,2}(s,s')/\delta s\right]_{(s,s')=(\psi_{i_1},\psi_{i_2})} + (\phi_{i_2}-s') \left[\delta C_{1,2}(s,s')/\delta s'\right]_{(s,s')=(\psi_{i_1},\psi_{i_2})} + (\phi_{i_1}-s) \left[\delta C_{1,2}(s,s')/\delta s'\right]_{(s,s')=(\psi_{i_1},\psi_{i_2})} + (\phi_{i_$$

where  $\psi_{i_1}$  is in between s and  $\phi_{i_1}$ , and  $\psi_{i_2}$  is in between s' and  $\phi_{i_2}$ . We follow the same steps as in Theorem 1, to bound the first order term of the Taylor expansion, and obtain that

$$\operatorname{cov}(Y_1(s), Y_2(s')|p_1(s), p_2(s'), C_{1,2}) \longrightarrow_{\epsilon \to 0} C_{1,2}(s, s'),$$

where  $p_1(s)$ , and  $p_2(s')$  are the potentially infinite dimensional vectors with the all probability masses in the spatial stick-breaking prior processes  $F_s(Y_1)$ , and  $F_{s'}(Y_2)$  respectively.

## A.4

#### Proof of Theorem 3.

Let  $\psi(t,s)$  be the characteristic function of Y(s). Then,

$$\psi(t, s_1) - \psi(t, s_2) = E_Y[\exp\{itY(s_1)\}] - E_Y[\exp\{itY(s_2)\}]$$

$$= E_X\left\{\sum_j p_j(s_1) \exp\{itX(\phi_j)\}\right\} - E_X\left\{\sum_j p_j(s_2) \exp\{itX(\phi_j)\}\right\}$$

$$= E_X\left\{\sum_j (p_j(s_1) - p_j(s_2)) \exp\{itX(\phi_j)\}\right\} \longrightarrow_{|s_1 - s_2| \to 0} 0.$$
(16)

Then,  $F_{s_1}(Y)$  converges to  $F_{s_2}(Y)$  for any locations  $s_1, s_2$ , as long as  $|s_1 - s_2| \to 0$ .

#### A.5

## Proof of Theorem 4.

The probability masses  $p_i(s)$  in (1) are  $p_i(s) = V_i K_i(s) \prod_{j=1}^{i-1} (1 - V_j K_j(s))$ . Since the bandwiths  $\epsilon_i$  converge uniformly to zero, then,  $p_i(s) \to 1$ , as  $|\phi_i - s| \to 0$ , where  $\phi_i$  is the

knot of kernel  $K_i$ . This holds because  $\sum_j p_j(s) = 1$  a.s. (since the process Y is properly defined).

Assume now  $|s_1 - s_2| \to 0$ , we need to prove that  $Y(s_1)$  converges a.s. to  $Y(s_2)$ . Let  $\phi_1$  and  $\phi_2$  satisfy,

$$|\phi_1 - s_1| \to 0$$
, and  $|\phi_2 - s_2| \to 0.$  (17)

Thus, we obtain that with probability 1,  $Y(s_1)$  converges to  $X(\phi_1)$ , and  $Y(s_2)$  to  $X(\phi_2)$ .

Since  $|s_1 - s_2| \to 0$ , and  $|\phi_1 - \phi_2| \le |\phi_1 - s_1| + |\phi_2 - s_2| + |s_1 - s_2|$ . Then, by (17)

$$|\phi_1 - \phi_2| \to 0. \tag{18}$$

We have,

$$|Y(s_1) - Y(s_2)| \le |Y(s_1) - X(\phi_1)| + |Y(s_2) - X(\phi_2)| + |X(\phi_1) - X(\phi_2)|,$$

where  $|Y(s_1) - X(\phi_1)| \to 0$  a.s., as  $|s_1 - \phi_1| \to 0$ ;  $|Y(s_2) - X(\phi_2)| \to 0$  a.s., as  $|s_2 - \phi_2| \to 0$ ; and since X is a.s. continuous,  $|X(\phi_1) - X(\phi_2)| \to 0$  a.s., as  $|\phi_1 - \phi_2| \to 0$  (which holds by 18).

Therefore,  $|Y(s_1) - Y(s_2)| \to 0$  a.s.